

REPUBLIC OF AZERBAIJAN

On the rights of the manuscript

ABSTRACT

of the dissertation for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

CONSTITUTIONAL LEGAL REGULATION OF LAW- MAKING IN THE REPUBLIC OF AZERBAIJAN: ANALYSIS OF THEORY AND PRACTICE

Speciality: 5607.01 - Constitutional law, municipal law

Field of science: Law

Applicant: **Elmira Elchin Qazvinova**

Baku–2023

The work was performed at the Department of Constitutional Law of the Baku State University.

Scientific supervisor: Doctor in Law, Professor
Nazim Hasan Jafarli

Official opponents: Doctor in Law, Associate Professor
Saida Bahram Hasanzade

PhD in Law, Associate Professor
Shahin Teyyub Shukurov

PhD in Law
Leyla Shahin Aliyeva

Dissertation Council ED 2.45 of the Higher Attestation Commission under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, operating on the basis of the National Aviation Academy.

Chairman of the
Dissertation council:



Doctor in Law, Associate Professor
Aykhan Khankishi Rustamzade

Scientific secretary of the
Dissertation council:



PhD in Law
Sahil Zahir Huseynov

Chairman of the
scientific seminar:



Dr., Prof.
Nuray Ekshi

GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF WORK

Relevance of the research topic. At the end of the 20th century, important events that took place on the world arena had an impact on the post-Soviet space and the peoples living for 70 years within the USSR began to fight for their independence. In the late 80s of the 20th century, this process became especially aggravated, and the collapse of the USSR became the reason for the emergence of new states. One of these states is the Republic of Azerbaijan.

After gaining independence in the 20th century, the people of Azerbaijan embarked on the path of building a democratic, legal state. The new Constitution, adopted on November 12, 1995, established the political, economic and social foundations of public life.

The people of Azerbaijan, on the basis of the first national Constitution, carried out radical reforms in all spheres of public life. One of the important areas of democratic reform is legal reform. In order to implement legal reforms, create democratic institutions and ensure the principle of the rule of law, interaction of legislative, executive and judicial authorities in 1996, on the initiative of the President, a legal reform commission was created.

At the first stage, this commission determines the priorities of the ongoing legal reforms and completely changed the philosophy of the legal system inherited from the Soviet Union. Legal reforms carried out in the Republic of Azerbaijan include universal democratic principles, such fundamental values as the rule of law and protection of human rights, and the principles of justice. At the same time, the history and traditions of the statehood of our people, the experience of state building of developed states were taken into account.

In addition, on June 8, 1996, a program on cooperation between the Republic of Azerbaijan and the Council of Europe was adopted to carry out legal reforms, as well as to integrate our country into Europe. Taking into account the provisions of the "European Convention for the Protection of Fundamental Human Rights and Freedoms", new laws are being adopted. [128] First of all, this commission prepared a sectoral legislative base - the Civil Code, the Criminal Code, etc. and as a legislative initiative of the President were presented to the Milli Mejlis.

Acceleration of the process of democratization, development of the economy, active participation of our republic in the process of globalization, ensuring human and civil rights, of course, makes it necessary to improve the legislative system.

Over the past decades, the Republic of Azerbaijan has been undergoing a dynamic, changing and developing process of establishing a new statehood. We are witnessing the intensive pace of the lawmaking activity of the Republic of Azerbaijan. In this regard, for domestic jurisprudence, this problem is of considerable interest, it is distinguished by the capacity of the content and the abundance of material. Within the framework of this, there are discrepancies of opinion, which implies the continuation of scientific research.

To form a perfect legal system on the basis of a new progressive Constitution, guided by the best world experience, global democratic principles, the Commission of Legal Reforms was created.

In the current period, for the democratization of society and the development of market relations, it is of great importance to carry out fundamental reforms in public administration. Reforms in this area should ensure an increase in the efficiency of public administration, the formation of the necessary institutions to regulate the balance of the economy, create a legal framework and a management system that meets international standards.

The relevance of this topic is due to the fact that it was not the subject of a comprehensive study by legal scholars. Consideration of this topic creates the need to develop research on the theoretical foundations of lawmaking, first of all, an appeal to the history of lawmaking, principles, types, etc.

The relevance of the research topic is due to the need for further improvement of various forms of state activity, among which lawmaking is the most important component of the legal formation process, providing state leadership of society. Also urgent is the task of forming and improving the legal basis of lawmaking activities of state authorities and the people. This topic is also important for improving the legislative base of the Republic of Azerbaijan.

Today, it is very relevant to improve the legislative powers of the parliament, increase the level of efficiency of the adopted laws.

The dissertation is devoted to a topical and insufficiently studied topic.

The degree of elaboration of the topic. Law-making activity was investigated in the works of Sh.T. Shukurova, J.A. Suleimanova, N.G. Shukurov, V.K. Kulieva, P.M. Kurdyuk, L.F. Ismagilova, N.S. Shmakova, H.I. Kaitaeva, S.A. Kuznetsova, N.A. Antonova, A.R. Nematova, A.B. Kozyreva, T.S. Maslovskaya, A.P. Mazurenko, E.V. Kamenskaya, V.F. Galushko, K.S. Kardamonova, F.S. Sosenkova, A.V. Urumov, S.P. Cherednichenko.

The subject of the research is the problems of theory and practice of lawmaking in the Republic of Azerbaijan.

The object of the research is the lawmaking activity of the state authorities of the Republic of Azerbaijan, as well as the mechanisms for ensuring the constitutional legality of this activity.

Goals and objectives of the study. The aim of the research is to analyze the theory and practice of lawmaking in the Republic of Azerbaijan.

In accordance with the set goal, the following tasks of the dissertation research are determined:

- study and comprehension of previously published works on the problems of lawmaking in general and the legislative process in particular;
- analysis of the factors that determine the legislative process;
- comprehension of the stages of the legislative process, development of proposals for improving legislative activity;
- to give the author's definition of the concept of lawmaking;
- determine the principles of lawmaking that are not reflected in the legislation;
- consider the types of lawmaking;
- to identify the problems of passivity of direct lawmaking of citizens;
- determine the current state of lawmaking activities in the Republic of Azerbaijan;
- to investigate the lawmaking activity of the legislative branch - Milli Mejlis;
- to study the legislative process in the Republic of Azerbaijan and

identify ways to improve it;

- analysis of the constitutional and legal foundations of the organization of the mechanism for ensuring constitutional legality in the field of lawmaking;

-analyze the practice of public authorities exercising constitutional control.

Methodological and theoretical foundations of the study.

The solution of the assigned tasks determined the choice of the research methodology. When studying the whole complex of problems posed in the dissertation, we used such general and specific scientific methods as analysis, synthesis, induction and deduction, sociological and statistical methods, as well as methods characteristic of legal science, such as the modeling method, the comparative legal method, etc. etc.

The empirical material consists of the laws in force, the law-making activities of state authorities, the law-making experience of our country, as well as the analysis of the legislation of foreign countries.

The theoretical basis of the dissertation was the works of legal scholars on the issues of lawmaking, lawmaking, and subordinate lawmaking. The work uses the works of M.N. Marchenko, A.B. Vengerov, A.F. Cherdantsev, V.V. Ivanov, A.R. Nematov, etc.

The scientific novelty of the work lies in the fact that this is the first comprehensive study of a monographic nature, dedicated to the topic of lawmaking in the Republic of Azerbaijan. In the dissertation work, the features of the direct law-making of the people are investigated, a mechanism for the implementation of this right, the law as the main law-making act and the law-making of the executive authorities has been developed.

The main provisions for the defense

1. Legal acts include not only normative legal acts, but also acts of a normative nature, non-normative legal acts and acts of interpretation. Considering all this, the following author's definition of the concept of lawmaking can be given: "Lawmaking is the activity of state bodies or the people aimed at creating, changing, abolishing legal acts. Lawmaking is aimed at the preparation and adoption of non-normative legal acts".

2. The legislative activity of the ADR developed in two directions: the full reception of the codified acts that existed in tsarist Russia and their

improvement to the requirements of the era; the adoption of separate legislative acts reflecting the foundations of the new state building.

3. One of the important principles that plays an extremely important role in the legal regulation of lawmaking is the principle of legal certainty. The principle of legal certainty includes the stability of legal regulation, excludes the possibility of ambiguous interpretation and, therefore, arbitrary application of the rules of law, ensures uniform law enforcement practice, provides guarantees of state protection of citizens, enables the participants of the relevant legal relations to reasonably foresee the consequences of their behavior and be confident in the invariability of their official recognized status, as well as the acquired rights and obligations.

4. The Constitution of the Republic of Azerbaijan, adopted by popular vote on November 12, 1995, in Art. 81 notes that the legislative power in the Republic of Azerbaijan is exercised by the Milli Majlis of the Republic of Azerbaijan. Bills are submitted to the Milli, adopted by him, and then signed by the President. The Constitution of the Republic of Azerbaijan does not provide for any changes in this legislative procedure, which makes it possible to speak with confidence about the inadmissibility of direct delegation of legislative powers in the Republic of Azerbaijan. In addition, the Constitution directly indicates the subordinate nature of the norms of legal acts of the President and the Government.

5. The right to legislative initiative of citizens is not the right to propose a referendum on this or that issue. These concepts differ in the number of citizens who apply with the initiative, legal basis, subject, subjects.

6. The author offers the following types of law-making initiative:

- direct initiative of the people, citizens, voters - 40 thousand citizens;
- the initiative of the representative (legislative) authorities - deputies of the Milli Mejlis;
- initiative of the executive authorities and officials - the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan;
- initiative of the judiciary.

7. Control is an important attribute of statehood and is a prerequisite

for the normal functioning of state bodies and legality. Legality is the guiding principle of state administration emanating from the Constitution. Legality expresses the correct understanding, acceptance and strict implementation of the rule of law by state bodies, public associations, officials and citizens. State control is an inseparable function of public administration for the implementation of obligations facing an individual, society, and the state. The essence of control is to monitor or verify a phenomenon.

8. Stages of formation of constitutional control in our state.

9. The concept of separation of powers and its impact on the legislative process

10. The constitutional and legal framework for interaction between the authorities in the legislative process

11. It is necessary to concentrate in one normative legal act the principles of lawmaking.

12. Amendments to the text of the Constitution of the Republic of Azerbaijan are proposed by the Milli Majlis of the Republic of Azerbaijan or the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, then the conclusion of the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Azerbaijan must first be obtained on the proposed amendments. The procedure for adopting additions to the Constitution of the Republic of Azerbaijan does not imply obtaining the conclusion of the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Azerbaijan, with which we do not agree. We believe that additions to the Constitution are also an important process, and obtaining the opinion of the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Azerbaijan, which performs the function of legal protection of the Constitution, is mandatory.

13. According to paragraph VI of Art. 96 The procedure for using the right of legislative initiative by 40,000 citizens of the Republic of Azerbaijan, who have the right to vote, is established by law. Unfortunately, this law has not yet been adopted. We have drawn up a draft law regulating the legal basis for citizens' legislative initiative. We hope that this bill will be discussed at a meeting of the Milli Majlis in the future.

The theoretical and practical significance of the work lies in highlighting the problems associated with lawmaking. The provisions of the dissertation research in the future can be used in the process of improving legislation, as well as in the course of lectures on the disciplines

"Theory of Law", "Constitutional Law".

Approbation. The main provisions and results of the dissertation are reflected in articles published in authoritative scientific publications, reports at scientific conferences.

The research materials were tested in the process of lecturing on the disciplines "Theory of Law", "Constitutional Law" at the Police Academy of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Azerbaijan.

Structure and volume of the dissertation. The dissertation work consists of an introduction, three chapters, the results of the work, a bibliography containing 128 titles and 3 appendixes. The total volume of the dissertation is 143 pages of typewritten text, and is 201524 characters. In particular, the introduction – 16984characters, the first chapter – 65032 characters, the second chapter – 73563 characters, the third chapter – 39890 characters and the result – 6055 characters.

SUMMARY OF THE WORK

The dissertation work consists of an introduction, three chapters, combining nine paragraphs, a bibliography and three appendices.

In the introduction of the dissertation, the relevance of the work is stated, the object and subject of research are determined, a list of the tasks necessary to achieve the goal of the dissertation is given, the structure and content of the work are described, as well as the sought results presented for defense.

The first chapter "Theoretical and constitutional foundations of lawmaking in the Republic of Azerbaijan" consists of three paragraphs.

The first paragraph of the first chapter is devoted to doctrinal approaches to the definition of the concept, features and constitutional principles of lawmaking.

The new Constitution of sovereign Azerbaijan declares the construction of a legal, secular state, ensuring the rule of law as an expression of the will of the people.

The historical practice of constitutional construction has shown a person that a high legal culture of society, the creation of a legislative

system, the formation of a democratic legal system as a whole, are the main prerequisites for building a legal, democratic state.

First of all, it is necessary to understand the concept of an effective legal system. What does an effective legal system mean and what factors determine the effectiveness of lawmaking? In our opinion, the study of these issues is of great theoretical and practical importance.

In this context, let us first consider the general theoretical and legal aspects of the concept of lawmaking. Despite the extensive study of this issue by foreign scientists, some researchers (A.V. Melekhin¹, A.G. Borisov²) are supporters of a restrictive (i.e. narrow) approach to interpreting lawmaking.

In a narrow sense, lawmaking means the very process of creating legal norms by the competent authorities. Despite the extensive study of this issue by legal scholars (T.N. Moskalkova³, M.N. Marchenko⁴), there are still some controversial views regarding the concept of lawmaking. In a broad sense, this process is "calculated" from the moment of the law-making concept and up to the practical implementation of the legal norm (preparation, adoption, publication, etc.). In scientific sources, some authors note that lawmaking in a narrow sense is expressed in a legal legislative form. In a broad sense, the project's law-making activities also include a preparatory stage, which is not of a non-legal nature. This stage is associated with the degree of objective need for the creation of a legal norm.

We consider a broad interpretation of the concept of lawmaking to be the most correct. In our opinion, the preparatory stage of the project should also acquire a legal character. Of course, in this case, the competent law-making and law enforcement bodies will be vested with the obligation to identify the objective need for the creation of a legal norm, as well as to timely identify existing shortcomings in the law and

¹ Мелехин А.В. Теория государства и права. М.: Консультант Плюс, 2009, 2-е изд. — р.189

² Борисов Г.А. Теория государства и права. Белгород: БелГУ, 2007. — р.175

³ Москалькова Т. Н., Черников В. В. Нормотворчество: научно-практическое пособие - Изд. 2-е, доп. и испр. - Москва : Проспект, 2015. – р.131

⁴ Марченко М. Н. Судебное правотворчество и судейское право / МГУ им. М. В. Ломоносова. Юрид. Фак. - М. : проспект, 2006. – р.85

take appropriate measures to improve the legislative system.

In the scientific community, the controversy regarding the concept of lawmaking does not end there. Unfortunately, legal scholars express different, sometimes contradictory opinions regarding the concept of lawmaking. The problem that complicates this provision is also connected with the fact that neither the Constitution nor the Constitutional Law "On Normative Legal Acts" operates with the term "lawmaking", and even less does it fix its definition. Here, instead of the term "law-making", the term "rule-making" is used. In legal doctrine, the terms "lawmaking" and "rulemaking" are different.

According to the judgments of some legal scholars, lawmaking is the activity of authorized entities to educate, change and abolish legal norms.⁵⁶⁷

The logic of reasoning leads to the following: firstly, lawmaking is conditioned not only by subjective, but also by objective factors. If we take lawmaking in the broad sense of the word, then in the preparatory stage of the draft normative legal acts an objective need arises for the formation of a legal norm, and this need is recognized, and the preparation of the project is planned. Secondly, in countries belonging to the Anglo-Saxon legal family, as well as to the family of customary religious law, lawmaking activities include the adoption of judicial precedents and legal customs.

In the legal literature, you can also find the following definition of lawmaking in the narrow sense of the word: "lawmaking is the activity of authorized government bodies for the preparation and adoption of regulatory legal acts."

It should be noted that one cannot completely agree with the above concept of lawmaking. First, lawmaking is carried out not only by state bodies, but also by referendum. In my opinion, ignoring the referendum, which is an important institution of direct democracy, is contrary to the principle of democracy. Secondly, law-making activity consists not only

⁵ Матузов Н. И., Малько А. В. Теория государства и права: учебник. — Юрист, 2004. — р.144-146

⁶ Теория государства и права. Учебник / Под ред. Малько А. В., Липинского Д. А.. — Издательство "Проспект", 2014. — р.199

⁷ Иванова М. Правовые акты органов управления. — Litres, 2017. 190 р.

of the adoption of normative legal acts. It should be noted that this concept also includes activities to amend and abolish regulatory legal acts.

The Constitutional Law “On Normative Legal Acts” does not use the term “law-making”. This Law defines the term "rule-making". The Constitutional Law “On Regulatory Legal Acts” states that normative activity is the activity of preparing, examining, adopting, amending, interpreting, suspending, or repealing normative legal acts.

In the definition of rule-making, specified in the constitutional law of the Republic of Azerbaijan “On normative legal acts”, some shortcomings can be indicated.

Firstly, this law gives a narrow definition of the concept of rule-making and at the same time leaves its first stage, planning, outside of law-making. As a result, this stage remains without appropriate legal regulation.

Secondly, the law states that rule-making activity is the activity of preparing, examining, adopting, amending, interpreting, suspending, or repealing normative legal acts. What about regulatory acts? Then it turns out that acts of a normative nature are not the result of rule-making activity? Based on the interpretation of the law, it can be concluded that the legislator, among acts of a normative nature, accepts only decisions of the Constitutional Court as law-making. Thus, the legal force of a normative legal act may be suspended by a decision of the Constitutional Court.

Summarizing the above, we can conclude that the majority of legal scholars mean by lawmaking the creation, change, and abolition of only legal norms. But we must not forget that lawmaking should mean not only the creation, change, and abolition of legal norms. The etymology of the word "law-making" means "to make law". As we know, legal acts include not only normative legal acts, but also normative acts, non-normative legal acts and acts of interpretation. Considering all this, we can give the following author's definition of the concept of lawmaking: “Lawmaking is the activity of state bodies or the people aimed at creating, changing, repealing legal acts. Lawmaking is aimed at the preparation and adoption of non-normative legal acts”

Lawmaking corresponds to its true purpose only when it is based on the principles approved by practice, which are organizational

principles that determine the essence, content, characteristic features and general direction of lawmaking. At the same time, modern legal doctrine is characterized by pluralism in relation to the principle of lawmaking.

Considering the great importance of the principles of lawmaking, it is necessary to strive for the most complete and accurate consolidation of the leading principles of lawmaking in the regulatory and legal prescriptions, clearly and clearly formulate them, and, if necessary, give them a detailed description. Since the Constitution has supreme legal force, it is at the constitutional level that the basic principles of lawmaking should be enshrined.

The second paragraph is devoted to the historical aspects of the constitutional and legal regulation of lawmaking in the Republic of Azerbaijan and highlighting the characteristic features of each of the stages of development. Azerbaijan has a rich history. Considering that the Republic of Azerbaijan is the successor of the Republic of Azerbaijan that existed from May 28, 1918 to April 28, 1920, we believe that consideration of the historical aspects of the constitutional and legal regulation of lawmaking in the Republic of Azerbaijan from this period is more appropriate. The period of existence of the Azerbaijan Democratic Republic will be marked as an important stage in the history of the law of our state. Despite its short existence, the republic was based on a modern form of government. A democratic republic was formed in the state, meeting the requirements of that time. State building was based on law. The first political and law document of the Azerbaijan Democratic Republic is the Declaration of Independence. The political and legal essence of this document is that it reflected the foundations of the political system of the state, a state with a parliamentary form of government and a democratic regime, the supreme bodies of state power, the responsibility of the government to parliament, the formation of parliament, domestic foreign policy, and the legal status of the individual.

The legislative activity of the ADR began in June 1918, even before the formation of the Parliament, in the work of the National Council. The ADR parliament emerged in a very difficult historical time. But despite such a difficult situation both in the region and within the country, the lawmaking activities of the ADR have left their mark on the history of our country. Since its inception, the Parliament has occupied an important

place in the political life of the country and played an important role in the formation of the country's political system. After the formation of the Parliament, the legislative process of the Parliament acquired a wide scale. The activities of the supreme legislative body in this area were built in two directions:

1. adoption of new laws
2. improvement of laws that retain temporary force through additions and changes that meet state and national interests.

The second direction provided for the gradual displacement of old laws with completely new laws.⁸

The main essence of all the amendments made is to bring the imperial legislation in line with the requirements of the new state building. At the same time, it should be noted that the improvement of the legislation of tsarist Russia was of a complex nature. As you can see, the Azerbaijan Democratic Republic, in addition to the reception of Russian legislation, improved legislation in accordance with the requirements of the era. Given the different nature of the amendments, we consider it appropriate to divide them into four groups:

1. Restoration of a legislative act in its previous wording;
2. Elimination of groups of articles or individual provisions;
3. Editing of acts adopted by the former government bodies;
4. Submission of individual articles in a new edition.

Having analyzed the lawmaking activities of the ADR, one can come to the conclusion that the legislation of our country has developed in two directions:

1. full reception of codified acts that existed in tsarist Russia and their improvement to the requirements of the era
2. adoption of separate legislative acts reflecting the foundations of the new state building

After the construction of the Soviet socialist state in Azerbaijan, the renewed "revolutionary legality" became the ideological basis of society. By "revolutionary legality" is understood the expediency and compulsory law and order on the part of the supreme bodies of the proletarian dictatorship. The main source of law is considered the decisions of the

⁸ İsmayılov Xəyyam. Azərbaycanın dövlət və hüquq tarixi. Bakı.: "Təhsil", 2006.- 720 səh.

courts, despite the fact that in the 20s. lawyers paid great attention to decrees.

For more than 70 years, the people of Azerbaijan, forced to live within the Soviet empire, although they lived with the dream of restoring independence, for objective reasons, were able to achieve this only at the end of the last century. On August 30, 1991, the Supreme Council of the Republic of Azerbaijan adopted the Declaration "On the restoration of the state independence of the Republic of Azerbaijan". On October 18, 1991, the "Constitutional Act on the State Independence of the Republic of Azerbaijan" was adopted. This Act officially proclaimed our republic the heir of the Azerbaijan Democratic Republic and independent. This act also reflects that the people of Azerbaijan have the inalienable right to choose their own form of government, determine their relations with other peoples and develop their political, economic and cultural life in accordance with their historical and national traditions, in accordance with universal values.⁹

Fundamental changes in the political and economic foundations during the period of independence led to changes in the legal system. On the other hand, the intensity of social changes included the emergence of new legal relations and the improvement of legal norms. According to the Constitutional Act adopted in 1991, all acts valid until the restoration of state independence, not contradicting the sovereignty and territorial integrity of Azerbaijan, acts that were not canceled in the manner prescribed by law were valid in the territory of Azerbaijan. In this regard, on October 28, 1992, a law was adopted, which defined the list of the above-mentioned laws.

The adoption of a new Constitution of an independent state was one of the important steps on this path. The definition of new provisions related to the legislative system in Title V entitled "Law and Law" of the Constitution was a progressive development. It is noted here that the legislative system of the Republic of Azerbaijan consists of the Constitution, acts adopted at a referendum, laws, decrees of the President, resolutions of the Cabinet of Ministers, acts of central executive authorities.

⁹ Azərbaycan Respublikasının Dövlət Müstəqilliyi haqqında Konstitusiya aktı <http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/6693>

In December 1998, President Heydar Aliyev issued a decree on the preparation of a program for reforms in the public administration system. A commission was formed, a program was drawn up based on the experience of a number of states and began to be implemented. The goal of the reform is to improve the legal system, to form a legal framework based on progressive and democratic values. The first task of constitutional reforms was to prepare the necessary laws in various branches of law.

The adoption of many sectoral regulatory legal acts, the introduction of many changes to previous codes and, first of all, the need for new codification acts - all this gave impetus to the implementation of urgent measures.

Thus, the first codification was carried out in the period of independence and the third in the entire history of our country, starting with the ADR. The difference between these codification works was that when adopting these laws, we used the experience of Soviet codification, and also tried to comply with European standards. The codification work went through several stages of its development:

1. preparation 1992-1995
2. development 1995-2000
3. improvement and adoption of new codes after 2000.¹⁰

The third paragraph examines the types of lawmaking.

Analysis of the Constitutional Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On Normative Legal Acts" gives grounds to single out the following types of lawmaking, depending on the subjects: direct lawmaking of the people in the process of holding a referendum (nationwide voting on the most important issues of state and public life); lawmaking of state bodies (for example, parliament, government); lawmaking of individual officials (for example, president, minister); lawmaking of local self-government bodies; lawmaking of public organizations (for example, trade unions).

The aforementioned Constitutional Law distinguishes the following types of lawmaking, depending on the legal force:

Lawmaking - lawmaking of the highest representative body - the

¹⁰ Quliyev Emin Ramiz oğlu. Azərbaycan Respublikası qanunvericiliyinin məcəllələşdirilməsi [Mətn]: hüquq e. üzrə fəls. d-ru al. dər. a. üçün təq. ed. dis.: 12.00.01 /E. R. Quliyev; Azərb. Resp. Təhsil Nazirliyi, BDU.-B., 2010.- p.176-177

Milli Mejlis, in the process of which normative acts of the highest legal force are issued - laws adopted in accordance with a complicated procedure); by-law lawmaking - the norms of law are adopted and put into effect by structures that do not belong to the highest representative bodies - the President, the Government, ministries, heads of enterprises, institutions. Subordinate lawmaking is characterized by greater efficiency, flexibility, less formality, and greater competence of the specific subjects implementing it.

In a democratic constitutional state, one of the important forms of lawmaking is the direct lawmaking of the people. In the scientific literature, this type of lawmaking is also called a legislative referendum, that is, the people, by voting, adopt a law or a change and addition to the legislation. In accordance with Art. 56 of the Constitution of the Republic of Azerbaijan, citizens of the Republic of Azerbaijan have the right to elect and be elected to the state bodies of the Republic of Azerbaijan, as well as the right to participate in a referendum. The recognition by the Constitution of the right of citizens to participate in a referendum as a form of exercise by the people of their power implies that the state assumes certain obligations to create political, legal, organizational and financial conditions for the mechanism for implementing this form of direct expression of the will of the people.

The referendum is one of the main forms of law-making activity. This is due to the close participation of Azerbaijani citizens in making the most important government decisions.

In some scientific sources, a nationwide discussion of the bill, a nationwide poll, etc. are also considered direct law-making of the people, with which we do not entirely agree.

We believe that the direct law-making of the people is a broader, conceptual concept and includes a nationwide discussion and a nationwide poll. In our opinion, these institutions can be used as stages of the law-making process, including the legislative process.

One of the basic principles of a modern democratic state is the principle of separation of powers. The principle of separation of powers presupposes the division of a single state power into three branches: legislative, executive and judicial. The separation of powers theory is based on the principle of checks and balances. Each branch of government

is independent, but this does not mean that they are completely isolated from each other. It is not uncommon for one state body to transfer its powers to another body.

The activities of state bodies are determined by the subjects of jurisdiction and powers with which it is endowed. There are two types of competence: own and delegated, or transferred. The first is defined as a permanent component, and the governing body fully and independently implements it. The second is transferred under certain conditions and, therefore, independence in the performance of this competence is limited.

One of the basic principles of a modern democratic state is the principle of separation of powers. The principle of separation of powers presupposes the division of a single state power into three branches: legislative, executive and judicial. The separation of powers theory is based on the principle of checks and balances. Each branch of government is independent, but this does not mean that they are completely isolated from each other. It is not uncommon for one state body to transfer its powers to another body.

The activities of state bodies are determined by the subjects of jurisdiction and powers with which it is endowed. There are two types of competence: own and delegated, or transferred. The first is defined as a permanent component, and the governing body fully and independently implements it. The second is transferred under certain conditions and, therefore, independence in the performance of this competence is limited.

Recently, in the constitutional practice of foreign countries, there has been a widespread use of the institution of delegated legislation (Great Britain, France, Spain, Moldova, Kazakhstan, etc.). This situation is explained by the aggravation of social life, the need for timely and prompt provision of legal regulation of newly arisen legal relations. To this end, the Parliament delegates part of its legislative powers to other subjects of power.

Explanatory Dictionary of S.I. Ozhegova defines “delegation” as “officially entrusting, directing.” But there are distinctive features between these concepts:[79]

1. When delegating, the lower body is vested with authority, which we do not observe when commissioning. When commissioned, no additional instructions are transferred to another body.

2. An act issued by way of delegation is endowed with the force of the issuing body, and an act issued by way of instruction is endowed with the force of the assigning body.

3. An assignment is possible only in relations of subordination, while delegation is possible in any legal relationship

4. If the assignment implies the obligation of the assigned body, then the delegation provides the right to choose the delegating body.¹¹

In the modern world, various constitutional and legal practices of delegated legislation have developed. From the point of view of the implemented models of delegated lawmaking, three main groups of countries can be distinguished:

1. Countries where the Basic Law does not allow the legislative activity of the government (Republic of Azerbaijan)

2. Countries where the Constitutions do not directly indicate their attitude to delegated legislation, i.e., does not approve, but also does not deny it. (e.g. UK)

3. States whose constitutions authorize the legislative activity of the Government and quite clearly regulate this process (Germany, France, Italy, Spain).

It is hardly possible to agree that delegated legislation detracts from the role of parliament, because:

A) Parliament delegates part of its powers to another body.

B) the delegation of legislative powers is not carried out indefinitely.

C) the parliament does not delegate all its powers, but only a part.

D) the head of state retains the right to sign laws.

E) the powers of the courts under delegated legislation do not change. For example, the Constitutional Court may recognize an act of delegated legislation as contrary to the Constitution and cancel it.

The second chapter "Lawmaking as a type of lawmaking in the Republic of Azerbaijan" consists of four sections and is devoted to the lawmaking process.

In the first paragraph, the issues of the constitutional basis of interaction between the authorities in the legislative process are considered.

¹¹ Ожегов С.И. Толковый словарь русского языка. <http://www.ozhegov.org/>

Since the proclamation of independence, fundamental and necessary changes have taken place in the national legislation, which laid the legal basis for the rule of law. Only with the beginning of fundamental socio-political, constitutional and legal transformations in the country, along with such values of world civilization as civil society, the rule of law, parliamentarism, constitutionalism, fundamental human and civil rights and freedoms, was the concept of separation of powers put forward.

The basis for the constitutional consolidation of this principle was laid in Art. 13 of the Constitutional Act "On the State Independence of the Republic of Azerbaijan": "State power in the Republic of Azerbaijan is based on the principle of separation of powers. Legislative power is exercised by the Parliament of the Republic of Azerbaijan. Supreme executive power belongs to the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan - the head of the Azerbaijan State. Judicial power is exercised by independent courts and in the supreme instances - by the Constitutional Court of the Azerbaijan Republic, the Supreme Court of the Azerbaijan Republic and the Supreme Arbitration Court of the Azerbaijan Republic - each within the limits of their powers". The interaction of authorities is a complex and responsible process. It is expressed in the coordination of various issues, as well as in the influence of the branches of government on each other. Both the executive and the judiciary act only on the basis of the rules of law adopted by legislators. But the latter develop these norms not in isolation, but in close connection and on the basis of projects and proposals emanating primarily from the executive authorities, primarily the government. The judicial branch of government not only presents to the other two branches extensive materials of law enforcement practice, the account of which is necessary for the rational management of the country, but also, one might say, "ennobles" legislative and executive activities, constantly paying attention to legal, and moral norms, and constitutional principles subject to strict adherence. That is, one of the important areas of interaction between government bodies is the interaction of these bodies (especially legislative and executive) in the legislative process.¹² The legislative process in the broad sense of the

¹² Иванов В.А. Правовые основы взаимодействия федеральных органов законодательной и исполнительной власти Российской Федерации в законодательном процессе. Дисс. канд. юрид. наук. – М., 2006, p.84

word includes those actions that take place outside the legislature and precede the introduction of a bill in the Milli Majlis. The legislative process is all the activity by which the will of the ruling class is formed.

The Constitution of the Republic of Azerbaijan (Article 96) established a system of officials and state bodies participating in the legislative process and their powers in this area. Determining the legal status of each of the public authorities is a prerequisite for delimiting the competence of participants in interaction in the legislative process.

The second paragraph examines the provisions concerning the law as the main law-making act.

Legislation is an important social and at the same time universal political and legal instrument for regulating social relations.¹³ Legislation is a democratic and social formula for managing society.

The third paragraph of the second chapter examines the preliminary work preceding the drafting of the text of the bill. Legislation, based on the semantic meaning of the word, is a creative social process. The law-making process depends on political, economic, legal, demographic, ideological and other factors. Due to the many factors influencing lawmaking, it is sometimes difficult to detect the need to pass a bill on a particular issue. The idea of adopting a new law, bill or amendment to existing legislation may be generated by a political situation. Very often, laws are passed due to economic and social factors.

It should be noted that not every overdue thought among the subjects of the legislative process can be the subject of a law, since legal regulation consists not only of legislative regulation. The preparation of a bill to amend a law, draft a current bill, or a codified bill varies. Before preparing new laws, it is necessary to understand why the existing laws do not work. A comprehensive check of a draft law at the stage of preparation can save deputies from hours of useless work, and the people from laws that have been adopted but are not being implemented.¹⁴

At first glance, it seems that preparing the text of a draft law is a

¹³ Горбань В.С. Понятие, теория и проблемы формирования общей концепции эффективности законодательства [Текст]: М.: ИД «Юриспруденция», 2009 г. –р.3

¹⁴ Парламентское право России: Учебное пособие/ Под ред. И.М.Степанова, Т.Я.Хабриевой –М.: Юристъ, 2000 г. – р.199

simple matter; entrusting this work to a competent person is enough. But in our opinion, two groups of specialists should participate in the drafting of the bill: specialists in this field of “subject specialists” (doctors, engineers, etc.), and deputies. But there are cases when it is not possible to achieve balance in the composition of the working group, one-sidedness inevitably appears in the content of the bill - the prevalence of organizational and technical schemes in the absence of a clear legal form for their implementation (this is a sure sign that “subject workers” have taken the upper hand in the working group), or on the contrary, the excessively detailed elaboration of legal constructions, with the general weakness of the substantive side of the bill (lawyers were in the lead in the working group).

The practice of adopting laws in the legislature shows that it is the joint work of lawyers and "subject specialists" that contributes to the effectiveness of the law.¹⁵

The fourth paragraph is devoted to the preparation, discussion, adoption and promulgation of laws. In the legal literature, the legislative process is considered as the process of the official passage of a draft normative act in the legislative body. Therefore, in many textbooks and monographs, the stages of the legislative process include legislative initiative, discussion of a bill, its adoption and publication.

An obligatory component of the process of preparing a draft legislative act is the creation of a concept of a future law, which should include a substantive component - the rules for determining the subject of legislative regulation; the prognostic component - to take into account the economic, social, political consequences of the adoption of the law; systemic component - to take into account the changes that will entail the adoption of a law in the system of law; dynamic component - to determine the operation of the law in time, in space, in a circle of persons. The concept of the future law should be based on a clear constitutional and legal concept of the law as a whole - the content of the law should correspond to the objective needs of the time, economic conditions, take into account the national mentality and peculiarities of law enforcement. The point is, when adopting a law, to reflect in this act not only its external

¹⁵ Парламентское право России: Учебное пособие/ Под ред. И.М.Степанова, Т.Я.Хабриевой –М.: Юристъ, 2000 г. – р.200

attributive qualities as a normative legal act, but also its essential content side as the main regulatory regulator of the most significant, typical, stable social relations.¹⁶

An important role in the legislative process is given to the right of legislative initiative. It should be noted that in the scientific legal literature there is no consensus that the legislative initiative is the first stage of the legislative process. Several authors propose to distinguish between the stages of creation (preparation) of a normative act, the need to adopt a law, and the planning stage of the legislative process.

Scholars who accept legislative initiative as the first stage of the legislative process do not agree on the content and limits of this stage: it can be considered that it begins with a bill or includes the initial stage of a proposed project. The legislative process begins with the inclusion of a bill on the agenda of the assembly. Thus, the phased implementation of the right of legislative initiative is usually excluded from the legislative process.

The concept of "legislative initiative" in the legislature has at least two key meanings. First, the legislative initiative is called one of the stages of the legislative process. Secondly, it is accepted as a personal right of competent subjects to submit bills (legislative proposals) to the legislature. The right to legislative initiative is the ability to submit bills to the legislature, that is, the original texts of laws.

It should be noted that the right of citizens' legislative initiative is not the right to propose holding a referendum on a particular issue. We consider it appropriate to consider the difference between the right to legislative initiative and the initiative to hold a referendum:

- the number of citizens who apply with the initiative (if at least 40 thousand citizens come forward with the right to legislative initiative, then at least 300 thousand citizens can apply with the initiative to hold a referendum);

- legal basis (the right to initiate a referendum is regulated by the Electoral Code; there is no law regulating the right to legislative initiative);

- subject (if a bill submitted to the Milli Majlis can be adopted by

¹⁶ Гулиев В.К. Закон как источник конституционного права Российской Федерации Дисс. канд. юрид. наук. – Челябинск., 2006, р.96

voting without a referendum, then otherwise it is impossible)

- subject (at least 300,000 citizens with active suffrage can apply to the President and the Milli Majlis with a proposal to decide on holding a referendum. But in any case, any issue to a referendum can be submitted by the Milli Majlis or the President; with the right of legislative initiative, citizens themselves directly submit a bill for discussion in the Milli Majlis).

The third chapter of the dissertation is devoted to ensuring the rule of law in law-making activities.

The study of the theory and practice of constitutionalism in Azerbaijan is of great importance in terms of the application of the principles of statehood and the development of a democratic society. Of course, there was a practice of constitutionalism in Azerbaijan. Constitutional acts were adopted in the ADR, and when Azerbaijan was part of the Soviet Union, the Constitution was adopted. The constitution adopted in the Soviet era did not reflect the interests of our country and its national identity. In fact, this document was purely formal for Azerbaijan. This also confirms the absence of provisions on national attributes and the state language are not reflected in the Constitution.

In the Republic of Azerbaijan, the legal order in the constitutional regulation of political relations, which began in the mid-90s, began to positively influence the legal system and the practice of implementing law, and the ideology of modern constitutionalism began to be adequately perceived in the socio-political sphere. However, the relationship between the individual and the state, public administration are multilayered.¹⁷

The adoption of the first Constitution of independent Azerbaijan became possible only at the end of the 20th century - in 1995. It was this date that laid the foundation for the emergence of the theory and practice of constitutionalism in Azerbaijan. The constitution of an independent country is its original value. Only the independence of the country allows it to reflect the national values, the interests of the people and the prospective development of the country in its constitution.

At the same time, in the countries of the Romano-Germanic

¹⁷ Гараджаев Дж. Я. Ценность конституционализма и конституционализация правовой системы//Azərbaycan Respublikası Konstitusiyası Məhkəməsinin Məlumatı . – 2011. – №1. – с. 80-85

(continental) system of law, to which the AR belongs, constitutionalism acquires its true reality where and when it is as an idea, the scientific and theoretical doctrine is embodied in the current system of legal regulation, guided by the basic element of legal life - the constitution, backed up by an effective institutional and organizational system that ensures legal self-development and protection of society and the state in accordance with the highest legal - constitutional - values.¹⁸

Constitutionalism is a government based on the recognition and observance of international human rights, limited by the constitution, a political system based on the constitution and constitutional methods of government. Constitutionalism is a system of ideas and ideas about a developed democratic state system based on a constitution. This concept also includes a system of social relations based on the constitution, which enshrined such values as the sovereignty of the people, limited state intervention in the affairs of society, the priority of human rights in society and the state.¹⁹

A special role in the system of modern constitutionalism belongs to the judiciary, in particular constitutional justice, both in solving law enforcement tasks (which is extremely important in itself) and in the implementation of transformative functions - not only in the law enforcement sphere, but also in the legal system of the state, which inevitably affects, among other things, the constitutional and legal component of state and legal development. The constitutionality of law-making implies the influence of the Constitution on the process of law-making, and in this case it is important to reveal the concept of constitutionalism. This chapter examines the issue of control in law-making activities. Control, as a specific activity of state bodies, is one of the important means of ensuring the rule of law in the law-making activities of the state, observing and protecting the rights and freedoms of man and citizen.

In general, constitutional control in all countries is seen as an important attribute of a democratic state, which is a means of ensuring the supremacy of constitutional provisions. In a broad sense, the main goal of

¹⁸ Зимин А.В. Конституционный контроль в системе разделения властей: теоретико-правовые аспекты Дисс. канд. юрид. наук. – М., 2002, р.60

¹⁹ Ibid

constitutional review is to eliminate legal acts of state bodies that contradict the requirements of the Constitution or their clear constitutional and legal content. In the formation of the legislative system, ensuring the compliance of legislative acts with the constitutional rights and freedoms of man and citizen, a large role belongs to the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Azerbaijan. Sometimes there are doubts about the democratic nature and legality of lawmaking. In such cases, the Constitutional Court is an effective mechanism for exercising control over the rule of law.

The main results of the dissertation work are published in the following scientific articles:

1. «Azərbaycan Respublikasında qanunvericilik prosesinin əsas mərhələləri» // - Bakı: “Qanun” elmi hüquq jurnalı, -2015. №07 (249), - s. 56-60
2. «Правотворчество: анализ актуальных вопросов» // Научная дискуссия: вопросы юриспруденции. Материалы XLIV международной науч.-практ. конф., Москва, -2015, - с.64-71
3. «Некоторые теоретические проблемы правотворчества» // Материалы международной научно-практической конференции, посвященной теме «Конституционные гарантии прав и свобод личности», - Украина: - 28 июня, - 2016 г., - с.40-42
4. «Конституционно-правовое регулирование принципов правотворчества» // - Bakı: “Qanun” elmi hüquq jurnalı, -2016. №03 (257), - s.32-38
5. “Hüququn əsas mənbəyi kimi normativ hüquqi aktların anlayışı və xüsusiyyətləri” // -Bakı: Polis Akademiyasının Elmi Xəbərləri, -2016. №3-4 (16), - s.127-132
6. «Совершенствование правотворческой деятельности на современном этапе с использованием теорий правовых школ» // - Москва: Вестник МГОУ Серия «Юриспруденция», - 2016. №4 стр. 15-23
7. «Конституционное право граждан Азербайджанской на участие в референдуме» // 18 iyun-İnsan hüquqları gününə həsr olunmuş “İnsan hüquqlarının müdafiəsi Azərbaycanın dövlət siyasətinin əsas istiqamətlərindən biri kimi” mövzusunda elmi konfransın materialları, AMEA, AR KM, AR Prezidenti yanında

- Bilik Fondu, -Bakı: - 18 iyun, - 2016-cı il, - s.113-118
8. «Делегированное правотворчество» // Ümummilli lideri H.Ə. Əliyevin anadan olmasının 93-cü ildönemünə və AMEA Fəlsəfə və Hüquq İnstitutunun 70 illiyinə həsr edilmiş “Hüquq elminin müasir problemləri: Azərbaycan Respublikasında insan hüquq və azadlıqlarının müdafiəsinin yeni tendensiyaları” mövzusunda VI Respublika elmi-nəzəri konfransın materialları, - Bakı: - 5-6 may, - 2016-cı il., - s.280-283
 9. «Непосредственное правотворчество народа» // Bakı Dövlət Universiteti Hüquq fakültəsi Azərbaycan xalqının ümummilli lideri Heydər Əliyevin anadan olmasının 93-ci ildönümünə həsr olunmuş “Heydər Əliyev və Azərbaycanda hüquqi dövlət quruculuğu” mövzusunda beynəlxalq elmi-praktiki konfransın materialları II cild, - BDU, Bakı: - 3 iyun, - 2016-cı., s.65-68
 10. «О некоторых вопросах официального опубликования нормативно-правовых актов» // Doktorantların və gənc tədqiqatçıların XX Respublika elmi konfransının materialları, II cild, - Bakı: 24-25 may, - 2016-cı il., - s. 234-235
 11. “Xalqın hüquqyaradıcılığı” //İnsan və vətəndaş hüquq və azadlıqlarının konstitusiya təminatının aktual problemləri Beynəlxalq elmi-praktiki konfrans, Polis Akademiyası s.264-270
 12. «Влияние теории естественного права на правотворчество» // Azərbaycan xalqının ümummilli lideri Heydər Əliyevin anadan olmasının 94-cü ildönemünə həsr olunmuş «Müasir dövrdə Azərbaycan Respublikasında hüquq elminin və təhsilinin əsas inkişaf tendensiyaları” adlı konfrans, BDU II cild, - Bakı: 1-2 iyun, - 2017, - s. 50-52
 13. «Указ Президента как один из видов правотворчества» // - Волгоград: Вестник Волгоградского Института Бизнеса «Бизнес. Образование. Право», - 2017. №4, - с. 307-310
 14. «Правотворческая деятельность Президента Азербайджанской Республики» // Regional cinayətçılığın kriminoloji tədqiqatının aktual problemləri” IV beynəlxalq elmi-praktiki konfrans, Polis Akademiyası, - Bakı, - 2017, - s.236-241
 15. «Влияние религиозно-правовой доктрины на правотворчество» // Doktorantların və gənc tədqiqatçıların XXI Respublika elmi

- konfransının materialları II cild, - Bakı: -24-25 oktyabr, - 2017-ci il, - s.75-77
16. «Особенности стадий законодательного процесса»// “Qanun” elmi hüquq jurnalı №01 2018, -s.55-58
 17. «Виды правотворчества» // “Qanun” elmi hüquq jurnalı №02 2018
 18. «Исторические аспекты конституционно-правового регулирования правотворчества в Азербайджанской Республике» Труды Академии МВД Республики Таджикистан 2018№1 (37) s.122-128
 19. «Daxili İşlər Orqanlarının hüquqyaratma fəaliyyətində insan və vətəndaş hüquq və azadlıqların təminatı» // Polis Akademiyasının Elmi Xəbərləri №3-4 (16) Elmi-hüquqi jurnal 2018 г., - s.67-71
 20. «Понятие и особенности правотворческой деятельности органов исполнительной власти» // Polisin 100 illiyinə həsr olunmuş “Azərbaycan polisinin tarixi və inkişaf perspektivləri” adlı Beynəlxalq elmi-praktiki konfrans, Polis Akademiyası, 2018, s.232-238
 21. «Конституционные основы взаимодействия властей в законотворческом процессе» // Doktorantların və gənc tədqiqatçıların XXII Respublika elmi konfransının materialları 22-23 noyabr 2018-ci il., - s.63-67
 22. «Эволюция конституционно-правового регулирования правотворчества в Азербайджанской Республике» // Azərbaycan xalqının ümummillə lideri Heydər Əliyevin anadan olmasının 95-ci ildönemünə həsr olunmuş konfrans BDU, 2018, s.167-171
 23. “Участие граждан в законотворческом процессе” Polis Akademiyasının Elmi Xəbərləri Elmi hüquqi jurnalı, 2019
 24. “Конституционный контроль в правотворческой деятельности” // Heydər Əliyevin anadan olmasının 96-cı ildönümünə həsr olunmuş konfransı, BDU, 2019, - s.57-62
 25. «К вопросу о праве законодательной инициативы» // Heydər Əliyevin anadan olmasının 96-cı ildönümünə həsr olunmuş XXIV Respublika Elmi-Praktik konfransı, BDU, 2019, s.86-90
 26. «Теоретические проблемы определения понятия, признаков

- и принципов правотворчества» // Azərbaycan xalqının ümummilli lideri Heydər Əliyevin anadan olmasının 97-ci ildönemünə həsr olunmuş konfrans BDU, 2020
27. «Доктринальные подходы к определению понятия, признаков и принципов правотворчества» // «Закон и право» Изд-во ЮНИТИ-ДАНА, 2020, с.44-48
 28. “On the issue of the right of legislative initiative” Qərbi Kaspi Universitetinin Elmi Xəbərləri Bülleteni, 2020
 29. «Правотворчество Азербайджанской Демократической Республики» Ежемесячный международный научный журнал // «European multi science journal», Венгрия, 2020, с.27-31
 30. «Подходы к определению понятия правотворчества» // “Heydər Əliyev və Azərbaycanın inkişaf strategiyası” adlı Respublika elmi-praktik konfransı, AR DTX-ın Heydər Əliyev adına Akademiyası, 2021, -s.87-89
 31. «Влияние теории естественного права на совершенствование правотворческой деятельности» // Ümummilli lider Heydər Əliyevin anadan olmasının 98-ci ildönemünə həsr olunmuş “Azərbaycanşünaslığın aktual problemləri” XII Beynəlxalq elmi-praktik konfrans, Bakı Slavyan Universiteti, 2021, -s.418-423
 32. «Конституционный контроль как фактор обеспечения эффективной правотворческой деятельности» // Azərbaycan xalqının ümummilli lideri Heydər Əliyevin anadan olmasının 98-ci ildönemünə həsr olunmuş “XXI əsrdə insan hüquq və azadlıqlarının müdafiəsi sahəsində müasir nəzəri və praktiki yanaşmalar” mövzusunda AR KM və AMEA Hüquq və İnsan Haqları İnstitutu tərəfindən birgə keçirilən elmi-praktiki konfrans Bakı, 2021
 33. “Роль конституционного контроля в обеспечении эффективной правотворческой деятельности” // AR DİN-in Polis Akademiyasının yaradılmasının 100 illiyinə həsr olunmuş “Müasir dövrdə daxili işlər orqanları üçün kadr hazırlığını həyata keçirən xüsusi təyinatlı ali təhsil müəssisələri: mövcud vəziyyət və perspektivləri” adlı Beynəlxalq elmi-praktiki konfrans, 2021, s.81-86

34. «Проблемы определения понятия и признаков правотворчества» // Международная научно-практическая конференция «Образование и наука в XXI веке» Казахстан, 21-22 мая 2021 г., с.24-27
35. “Hüquq-mühafizə orqanlarının fəaliyyətində insan və vətəndaş hüquq və azadlıqlarının təminatı” //İdare hukuku ve idari yargı uluslararası sempozyumu İstanbul, 24-26 mayıs 2021
36. «Problems of defining the concept and signs of law-making» // Azərbaycan Respublikasının Konstitusiya Məhkəməsi Konstitusiya gününə həsr olunmuş “Hüquqi dövlətin əsasları” adlı elmi-praktiki konfrans, Bakı, 2021
37. «On the issue of the right of legislative initiative» // DTX-ın Heydər Əliyev adına Akademiyasında keçirilən “Azərbaycan Respublikasının suverenliyinin, müstəqilliyinin və ərazi bütövlüyünün konstitusiya əsasları” adlı elmi-praktiki konfrans. Bakı, 5 noyabr 2021. – s.382-388
38. “Interaction of authorities in the legislative process”// Bilimsel araşdırmalar. Tezis və məqalələr toplusu, 2021, -s.172-173
39. “Delegated lawmaking” //”East European Scientific Journal”2022 №4(80) s.53-54
40. “The role of the president in the legislative process” //Journal of science, Lyon 2022 №33 s.16-18
41. Constitutional control as a factor of ensuring effective law-making activities Simpozium materialı //The XXVIII International Scientific Symposium “Karabakh is My Native Land” dedicated to the 190 th anniversary of Khushidbanu Natavan, Baku 2022 s. 129-132
42. "Doctrinal approaches to the definition of the concept, features and principles of lawmaking"//Международный научно-практический журнал "Endless Light in Science" г. Алматы, Казахстан, 2023 №6 s. 556-560
43. “Preliminary work preceding the drafting of the text of the bill”//The XXXVII International Scientific Symposium “Haydar Aliyev and Development Strategy of Azerbaijan: New Trends in Modernization” Turkiye 29 aprel 2023 s. 319-322

The defense will take place on 22 December 2023 at 11.00 at the meeting of the Dissertation Council ED 2.45 operating on the basis of the National Aviation Academy.

Address: Baku city, Mardakan avenue 30.

The dissertation can be found in the library of the National Aviation Academy.

The electronic version of the dissertation and abstract is posted on the official website (www.naa.az) of the National Aviation Academy.

The abstract was sent to the appropriate addresses on 20 November 2023.

Signed for print: 17.11.2023

Paper format: A5

Volume: 44994

Number of hard copies: 20